

# **PEOPLE'S UNION FOR CIVIL LIBERTIES, RAJASTHAN**

*PUCL Jaipur Bomb Blast Study Series - 3*

## **Who is Responsible for Rebuilding Lives of Innocent Victims and Families? State response falls far short of the role expected of it.**

*Interim Report of the Socio Economic Conditions of the  
Families of those Killed in the  
Jaipur bomb blast<sup>1</sup>.*

### **Introduction**

The People's Union for Civil Liberties, Rajasthan, has been actively involved in examining the various issues emerging from the Jaipur bomb blast of 13 May 2008 and drawn the conclusion that the State response has fallen far short of expectations.

As a Civil Liberties organisation we thought that such a heinous incident whoever be the perpetrators, takes place to create fear amongst the people. Since the context in which these attacks are received is also fraught with a certain ideology / politics of "national security" and communal polarisation hence the issues of civil liberties and that of human life become are central concern as well as examining the State response to it.

In the aftermath of the bomb blast the poor Bengali Migrant in particular the Muslim migrant was made a scapegoat of the terror attack and over 140 people were arrested and detained illegally under the sections of vagrancy the Cr PC, there being no desire to grant bail. PUCL had to move to the High Court to ensure that justice was done and bail was granted. The matter has been taken cognisance of by the National Human Rights Commission which has written to the GOR with regard to providing them with water, food and medicines. .

The PUCL undertook two studies in Jaipur and Ajmer, examining the migrants civil liberties and the impact the arrests had on their food security. Two interim reports were released in the month of May and June 2008 and the final report will be out shortly.

The second intervention consisted of exposing the Rajasthan Police's attitude of profiling of the Muslim in the State as the terrorist; the presupposition of all investigations has been that the "terrorist is the Islamist". PUCL has been documenting this dimension and has from time to time issued press statements. On

---

<sup>1</sup> [The report of the socio economic survey of the injured is under preparation](#)

numerous occasions, PUCL has demanded that the ordinary Muslim live in peace. The investigations ought to stop profiling and bring accountability to the real culprits,

Finally we had announced in the beginning itself that we would go house to house and understand how the innocent victims of the bomb blast were coping with their lives and also examine the state support towards the rebuilding of their lives. This house to house visit was undertaken as a study and we tried to examine the Socio-Economic conditions of these families so that State and Societal Support could be better directed.

**In June and July of this year, PUCL undertook the study of more than forty-two families of the deceased and sixty families of those seriously injured in the bomb blast. The study was guided by Dr. Ashok Khandelwal, Advisor to the Supreme Court Commissioner in the right to food matter, with Sh. Vijay Goyal as data Analyst. More than fourteen intern- students from various Law and other Arts colleges completed the field study. The study is ongoing.**

**To quote from the field notes from one of the researchers, "Our teams met all the categories of the affected the families of the deceased and the injured and our experience left us empty of all sort words of sufficient expression to describe the strength of the human will that some times breaks down but continues to fight despite everything. It humbled us inspired us and at a point left us in tears".**

Essentially, the report comprises both the qualitative and quantitative data generated by the study and tables documenting the observations.

## **Part I - What the Data Reveals**

### ***1. The demography of the Deceased and those surveyed.***

A total of sixty- eight people were killed in the bomb blast belonging to five states. Of the sixty-eight, 79% (number better?) originated from Rajasthan and seven were unidentified. Our study covered approximately 75% of the identified homes of the deceased. Out of the forty-six homes, three did not agree to give interviews, one was not available and forty-two fully cooperated with the study.

Before concluding our final report, we are endeavouring to reach those belonging to other parts of the State and the country.

## **TABLE - 1**

### **State and District- wide data of the Deceased and those who involved in the Study**

<b>S. No</b>	<b>State</b>	<b>District</b>	<b>Town / Tehsil</b>	<b>Done</b>	<b>Not Done</b>	<b>Not Agreed</b>	<b>Total</b>	<b>percent</b>
1	Rajasthan	Jaipur	City	<b>34</b>	1* NA	3	38	
			Chomu	<b>2</b>			2	

			Chaksu		1		1	
			Virat nagar		1		1	
			Bassi	<b>1</b>			1	
		Sikar		<b>3</b>			3	
		Alwar		<b>2</b>	2		4	
		Jalore			1		1	
		Tonk			1		1	
		Sirohi			1		1	
		Nagaur			1		1	
							<b>54</b>	<b>79.4</b>
2	Bihar				3		3	4.4
3	W. Bengal				2		2	2.9
4	Gujarat				1		1	1.5
5	U.P				1		1	1.5
			<b>Total</b>	<b>42</b>	<b>16</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>61</b>	
			Unidenti fied		7		7	10.3
							<b>68</b>	<b>100</b>

## II. The age group which bore the brunt of the Attack.

**TABLE II**

### **AGEGROUP of the Deceased**

Age Group	Frequency	Percent
below10	4	5.9
11-18	5	7.4
19-35	30	44.1
36-58	23	33.8
above 59	6	8.8
Total	68	100.0

The attack targeted thickly populated public places such as temples and city squares and was timed for peak hours. All ages were affected by the bomb blast and those most affected belonged to the age group 19-35. More than 44 % of victims fell into

this bracket and 33.8% of victims were aged between 36-58 years. This gave a total of 77% of the deceased being between the ages of 19-58 years, those when one is a primary livelihood provider.

The extent of the tragedy was highlighted by the death of young innocents who numbered nine in total or put otherwise, represented 13 % of the deceased.

### III. Women and Men of all ages were affected

		AGEGROUP					Total	percent
		blow10	11-18	19-35	36-58	above 59		
SEX	Male	1	3	26	21	4	55	82.3%
	Female	3	2	4	2	2	13	19.1%
Total		4	5	30	23	6	68	100

The percentage of females killed was in the region of 20% and affected the entire spectrum of age ranges. Young girls, adolescents, those in the prime of their life, those of child bearing age and grand-mothers were all victims of the tragedy.

### Table IV: ALL CASTES AND RELIGIONS BORE THE BRUNT

Caste and Religion Break up

	Frequency	Percent
SC	2	2.9
OBC	9	13.2
Gen	17	25.0
No information on caste	24	35.3
Muslims	16	23.5
Total	68	100.0

### RELIGION

	Frequency	Percent
Muslim	16	23.5
Hindu	52	76.5
total	68	100.0

## **WHAT OUR FIELD DATA REVEALS**

The data collated from the forty-two homes of the deceased has been very insightful. The report provides a brief analysis and evaluation of effect the blast has had on the women who lost their husbands and the children who lost either parent. The data will address the situation where the earners were killed and the survey has moreover investigated how the compensation money was used.

In essence, the study reveals that the deaths have hugely impacted food consumption in households and there has been a substantial reduction in income. The situation of loans and other outstanding liabilities is a matter of serious concern to several households, and what is more, in most cases, the present condition of rehabilitation is without any plan.

### **A. IMPACT OF THE ATTACK ON THE WOMEN LOST THEIR HUSBANDS AND THE CHILDREN WHO LOST THEIR FATHERS IN THE BLASTS**

Of the forty-two households studied, twenty-two families lost their husbands or Fathers. This high percent of women being left without their main earner is a cause of serious concern and planning of State victim rehabilitation should focus on this area..

Table V shows that a total of 55 children are now dependent on their mothers, who must now act as head of the household. Table VI details the dependents; more than forty- six children are of the schooling age and ten are between the ages of eighteen and twenty-four.

Table VII, which needs to be prepared, shows that in seven families children have already been withdrawn from school. Of the seven families, five have totally withdrawn girls from school and they will therefore be denied schooling. The necessity for education is a compelling ground for State intervention and the State response must be immediate because delay will hamper the growth and development of these children.

The research moreover, shows the poorest households across the country are those of single women and the socio-economic vulnerability of single- women and their households has been well documented by NSSO data.

Therefore, the State must ensure that educational, employment and marriage opportunities for the children of single- women households are not curtailed. This is the challenge.

**TABLE no V: DETAILS OF THE WOMEN WHO LOST THEIR HUSBANDS AND THEIR CHILDREN**

	Name of Widow	Age;	Religion	Number of Children	Age of Children
1.	Nita	23	Hindu	2	daughter- 6, Son- 4
2.	Manisha	38	Hindu	2	daughter- 16, Son- 13
3	Rubina	35	Muslim	3	daughter- 8,1, Son- 6
4	Vimla	60	Hindu	0	Not Applicable
5	Chetna	25	Hindu	4	2 daughter 2 Son
6	Ritu	32	Hindu	2	daughter- 9, Son- 4
7	Jyoti	25	Hindu	0	Not Applicable
8	Rita	43	Hindu	4	3 daughter- 20,23,18 1 Son- 14
9	Veena	32	Hindu	2	2 Son- 8, 1.5
10	Bano	33	Muslim	5	4 daughter- 17, 11,8, 6 1 Son- 13
11	Rajeshwari	38	Hindu	6	5daughter- 22,20,19,15,13 1 Son- 18
12	Pinki	33	Hindu	2	daughter- 11, Son- 13
13	Shabana	23	Muslim	1	daughter- 15 Days
14	Maina	35	Hindu	2	daughter- 5, Son- 2.5
15	Anjana	35	Hindu	3	3 Son- 14, 12, 10
16	Gayatri	38	Hindu	1	Son- 10
17	Govinda Kanwar	30	Hindu	3	2 daughter- 10, 8 1 Son- 4
18	Shanti	26	Hindu	3	1 daughter- 6 2 Son- 4, 3
19	Alka	36	Hindu	2	2 Son- 14, 12
20	Rekha	25	Hindu	2	2 Son- 3, 5 months
21	ChandraKala Devi	44	Hindu	4	3 daughter- 20,17,13 1 Son- 16
22	Premlata	4	Hindu	2	2 Son- 4, 3
				55	

The age group of the widows and the number of Children that need to be looked after

S. No	Age group of women	Number of women	Number of Children
1	Less than 30 years	6	15
2	31-35 year	7	21

3	37 to 44 years	7	10
---	----------------	---	----

**TABLE VI: SUMMARY TABLE OF THE NUMBER OF CHILDREN DEPENDENT ON THEIR MOTHERS**

S. No	Age group of children	Girls	Boys	Total
1	Less than 11 years	10	13	24
2	12-18 years	11	11	22
3	Less than 24 years	7	3	10
	Total	28	27	55

**TABLE VII**

**Families who have withdrawn their children from school. (to be placed later)**

**B. IMPACT ON THOSE CHILDREN WHO LOST THEIR MOTHERS**

The bereavement of women has denied children their mothers, see tables VIII and IX, and it was shocking to learn that more than ten children have been left without their mothers. These children are presently staying with grand- parents, uncles, aunts and some with their fathers. The sudden dislocation is by itself cause for concern. What is of greater concern, however, is that, these people will determine the future of the children. It has been observed that middle and lower middle income group families generally marry- off girls whose mothers are deceased, because the child's security becomes an issue and may be a burden for the father, grand parents, aunts and uncles.

To prevent this detrimental situation from arising, the State must intervene and provide educational and other scholarships for these children.

**TABLE VIII - List of mothers who died in Bomb Blast**

S.No.	Name of mother	Total Number of Children	Age	Age of Children
1	Bano	3	30	Son-15, Son-13, Son-9
2	Sumara	2	26	daughter- 4, Son- 9
3	Kausalya	1	62	Daughter-30
4	Bhuneshwari	2	24	Two daughter- 6,6
5	Meena	3	35	Two daughter- 18,17, Son- 15

**TABLE IX: CHILDREN DEPENDENT ON THEIR FATHERS AND OTHERS**

S. No	Age group of Children	Number of Girls	Number of Boys	Total number of Children
1	Less than 11 years	3	2	5
2	31-35 year	7	3	5

**C. INFORMATION CONCERNING THE WOMEN WHO LOST THEIR HUSBANDS (WIDOWS OF THE BLAST)**

The field notes of one of the researchers read "The first thing one noticed about the condition of the widowed women was that they were shattered, economically, socially and psychologically. They are now the victims of the most horrendous, regressive age old social taboos that have been prevalent in our society for centuries. There are mixed feelings, those of aggression, depression and silence. These are the most lethal silences, since there is nobody to blame, since nobody knows who was behind these blasts"

"The conclusion that we all unanimously came to was that although the victims have been given nominal aid, there has been a downfall in the lifestyle, living standards and nutrition intake. But most of all, the loss of a loved one cannot be quantified, or shown on a graph, although it still remains the state's responsibility to provide food security, social security to the aged and government jobs to the needy families, and in the long run, this is what will make the state a welfare state in practice instead of mere theory".

**One area of the questionnaire related to the emotional and psychological condition of the women who lost their husbands. The remainder of the study addressed how the women were coping with the new situation and how the compensation was used. The researchers were trained to examine these questions with help of a clinical psychologist who gave them suitable indicators and questions to enumerate this. However, on some questions the final assessments were reached by experts.**

**More than 23 percent of the women who had lost their husbands were in a state of depression, with one now continually silent. None of the women had as then made any future plans for their lives and fourteen had not even begun thinking of the issue. These revelations augment the very real disturbed mental state of the widowers.**

**Only three, or around 15% of the women have their own homes, fourteen, or 63.6%, are residing in the shared household of their in-laws and a further four residing their natal homes. Numerous disputes relating to residence in shared households exist and widows are frequently dragged into costly and unnecessary litigation. These problems add to the vulnerability and disturbed mental state of**

the widows, displaying just how acute the situation is and the desperate need for intervention.

All the widows save one have collected the five lac rupees compensation. In the one case the matter is being contended in the civil court, because the in-laws prevented a separated daughter-in-law from collecting compensation. However, despite the compensation being released and collected major disputes are prevalent. One case study has been given below.

**Table X : How is she taking the tragedy:**

	Frequency	percent
<b>Total Widows</b>	22	
<b>Depressed</b>	10	45.4%
<b>Has Become Silent</b>	1	4.6%
<b>normal</b>	11	50%
<b>Total</b>	42	100%

**Table XI : Where is she now**

Respondent	Frequency	
<b>Total Widow</b>	22	
<b>inlaws home (Sasural)</b>	14	
<b>natal home (Pihar)</b>	4	
<b>Living Independently</b>	3	
<b>other Place</b>	1	
<b>Total</b>	42	

**Table XII: Has she made a plan to rehabilitate herself and her family**

	Frequency	Percent
<b>total Widow</b>	22	52.4%
<b>No Answer</b>	2	4.8%
<b>No</b>	6	14.3%
<b>Have not thought about it</b>	14	33.3%
<b>Total</b>	42	100.0%

**Table XIII: Has she got the Compensation by the GOR**

	Frequency	Percent
<b>total Widow</b>	22	50
<b>yes</b>	21	45.2
<b>No</b>	0	2.4
<b>Matter in Court</b>	1	2.4
<b>Total</b>	42	100

**Table XIV How has the Compensation been used**

	Frequency	Percent
No answer	22	52.4%
invested	17	40.5%
gave to Family	1	2.4%
spent	1	2.4%
paid debts	1	2.4%
<b>Total</b>	<b>42</b>	<b>100</b>

Case study of Rekha Paswan is one of the most distressing cases that have emerged from the study. Sanjeev Paswan, one of those who died in the blasts, was a poor migrant from Bihar and worked as a rickshaw puller. He was the only earner, and it was upon him to provide for his wife, two very young children, elderly parents and three brothers, one of whom was married. Naturally, there were many who suffered in the aftermath of the blast within this particular family.

On speaking to the parents of the deceased, the impression was given that the wife of the deceased would continue living with her in-law and that there was no dispute over compensation. However a telephone conversation with the widow revealed that out of the 5 lakh rupee compensation, 4 lakh rupees had been fixed deposited in the children's name against her wishes; she was however, made one of the nominees for the FD's. The amount she will receive for herself is a mere Rs 50,000, yet to be acquired. She also revealed that she does not get along with her in laws, and she will not remain in her marital home.

Looking at this and similar cases, PUCL urge the authorities to implement a wholesome, comprehensive and clear-cut compensation package; one which would demarcate one party's share from the other.

#### **D. THE DECEASED AS THE EARNER AND ITS IMPACT ON INCOME**

Table X shows that 71 percent of the men who died were earners of the family, of which eleven were the sole earners of the joint and nuclear family. This is a very high figure and shows the impact on these households exists at multiple levels. PUCLs research also shows that this has resulted in a reduction in income of the household by 66 percent (see Table XI). Table XII shows the present source of income.

Table XV

<b>Was the Deceased an Earner</b>		
	Frequency	Percent
<b>Valid</b>	<b>Yes</b>	30 71.4
	<b>No</b>	12 28.6
	<b>Total</b>	<b>42</b> <b>100</b>

Table XVI

<b>Variation ( Reduction) in The Income</b>		
	Frequency	Percent
<b>Valid</b>	<b>No Answer</b>	2 4.8
	<b>Yes</b>	28 66.7

	<b>No</b>	12	28.6
	<b>Total</b>	42	100

Table XVII

<b>Present Source of Income</b>		
	<b>Frequency</b>	<b>Percent</b>
<b>No Answer</b>	20	47.6%
<b>Family Member and Others</b>	4	9.5%
<b>Borrowed</b>	2	4.8%
<b>labor work</b>	1	2.4%
<b>No Income Source</b>	12	28.6%
<b>Pension</b>	1	2.4%
<b>Self emp</b>	2	4.8%
<b>Total</b>	42	100

### **E. IMPACT ON FOOD CONSUMPTION**

This was the most difficult question that we asked as nobody wishes to expose their homes to this extent that they will talk of the situation of hunger and denial of food. However, 19 percent of the households clearly stated that the food consumption had declined. Some of them had stopped giving breakfast to their children and some had even stopped the daily glass of milk for their children. Those who did not answer left it to our imagination to deduce that this was a possibility.

### **XVIII Effect on the Food Consumption**

	<b>Frequency</b>	<b>Percent</b>
<b>No Answer</b>	3	7.1
<b>Yes</b>	8	19
<b>No</b>	31	73.8
<b>Total</b>	42	100

### **F. IMPACT ON THE OLD AND OTHER DEPENDENTS**

The blast has affected not simply women and children, but many others, including elderly parents, aunts and uncles who were dependent on an earner killed in the blast. More than half the families, or twenty- one, surveyed provided for elderly persons who had also lost direct economic support. Thirteen of these were women and fifteen men. Ten of the elderly persons lost their only source of support and six mothers had lost their sons, upon whom they were dependent. Furthermore, over ten families had other dependents; sisters, aunts, or nephews and nieces who had lost their direct bread winner. .

Quite clearly, there is a very visible case for the State providing social security to all dependents; elderly and young.

**Table XIX: FAMILIES WITH PARENTS ABOVE 60 years of age**

	Frequency	Percent	Male	Female
Yes	21	50	15	13
No	21	50		
Total	42	100		

**Table XX : Dependants In Addition to the children and the old parents**

	Frequency	Percent
no Answer	2	4.8
Yes	10	23.8
No	30	71.4
Total	42	100

### **G. BURDEN OF LOANS AND OTHER LIABILITES ON THE FAMILIES OF THE DECEASED**

Tables XXI to XXV show families have been left with payments to make, loans and other liabilities. More than 33 percent of the families have loans which they must continue paying since the bereavement of the primary earner. The purposes of the loans are honest and examples include, shop, educational, home consumption and house construction. In twelve homes the extent of the loans varied from 4000 Rupees to seven lacs Rupees. Some families informally commented that they had more than 20 lacs rupees of business debt.

Moreover, many families had other regular liabilities to pay, such as Insurance premium, health bills and school fees.

**Table XXI : Loans which have not been paid because of the Death**

		Frequency	Percent
Valid	No Answer	3	7.1
	Yes	14	33.3
	No	25	59.5
	Total	42	100

**Table XXII : Loan Details**

	Frequency	Percent
not applicable	28	66.7
House Loans	6	14.3
Educational Loans	1	2.4
Consumption Loan	1	2.4
Institutional Loan	5	11.9
Others	1	2.4
Total	42	100

**Table XXIII : Extent of the loan payments that have to be made**

	Frequency	Percent
No Answer	30	71.4

<b>Not Specified</b>	7	16.7
<b>4000</b>	1	2.4
<b>20000</b>	1	2.4
<b>22200</b>	1	2.4
<b>25000</b>	1	2.4
<b>700000</b>	1	2.4
<b>Total</b>	42	100

**Table XXIV : Any other Outstanding Liabilities**

	<b>Frequency</b>	<b>Percent</b>
<b>No Answer</b>	8	19
<b>Yes</b>	6	14.3
<b>No</b>	28	66.7
<b>Total</b>	42	100

**Table XXV Specific Liabilities other than loans**

	<b>Frequency</b>	<b>Percent</b>
<b>Not Specified</b>	8	19
<b>Insurance Premium</b>	2	4.8
<b>Health Related</b>	3	7.1
<b>School Fees</b>	4	9.5
<b>No Answer</b>	25	59.5
<b>Total</b>	42	100

## CONCLUSIONS

1. Formation of a State policy and a making of a law Guaranteeing rehabilitation as a right.

The PUCL is very concerned that there is no policy which guides rehabilitation of the victims of such blasts. The concept of rehabilitation should be recognised as a right and not dependent on the whims and fancies of the present day Governments. The Rupees 5 lac ex-gratia payment from the GOR is all that the families have received. There is some talk of the Jaipur Municipal Corporation providing Kisoks, however, this is a far away response and presently nothing has been given. Rupees 1 lac was given to 85 of the seriously injured and 25,000 to 55 injured with minor injuries.

PUCL observed that the, 1 lac Rupees promised from the Prime Minister's relief fund is yet to reach the families of the deceased in all but two cases. PUCL would like to remind the PMO that their promise should be fulfilled.

According to news reports, the Indian Premier League gave Rupees 6 crores to the CM Relief Fund especially for the Bomb Blast victims and others private agencies including some banks gave more than 3.6 crore rupees. This has remained an announcement and no-one has received money from this source.

Rupees 35 lacs of the unidentified deceased victims should be put aside as a fund for the families of the deceased.

- PUCLs first recommendation is for the implementation of a law guaranteeing the State's obligations to families of the victims of such tragedies. This ought to apply to the families of the victims of the Jaipur bomb blast, who must get their due as a right.
- The law concerning internally displaced persons due to tragedies, natural and man made disasters should be extended to include victims of bomb blasts.
- The law concerning Relief and Rehabilitation for the first time introduces rehabilitation as a right to life issue. PUCL consider the right to rehabilitation should be extended to bomb blast victims. \

2. The Government of Rajasthan should announce a special package for the single women and the children who have lost either parent.

- PUCL recommends the package should include full educational scholarships and educational funds for higher studies including professional courses. The State should adopt full responsibility for the children and the State should protect the children's hopes and dreams. The letter from the Government establishing this guarantee should be provided to the families of the victims today so that they can avail of the opportunity in the future.
- The expenses of the children's marriage should also be borne by the State. Money should be allocated to the bank accounts of the children for use at after a particular age.
- Widows should be given Governmental employment on priority relative to their educational qualifications.
- Widows who do not have homes should be given interest free house loans or housing under Indira Awaas at the least.
- Widows should be given Antyodaya Ration cards. With an entitlement to 35 kgs of grain per card, per month at Rupees 2 per kg. This mark was assured by the SC to the Gujarat riot victims, in the PUCL matter on the right to food.
- The widows should be linked with the Health Insurance Schemes
- The emotional and psychological need of women must be provided by social workers and psychologist.

3. Social Security Package should be prepared for elderly parents and other dependents of the deceased.

- Pensions should be provided by the State.
- All dependents should be linked with Health Insurance and security scheme.

- Elderly parents should be given Antyodaya Ration cards, on the basis of 35 kgs of grain per card, per month at Rupees 2 per kg.

4. The injured must be re-assessed and treatment restarted in several instances. Many of the injured are not in a position to resume work and their families must be provided with support.

*The report was done by Madhav Sharma, Vaibhav, Vibha Arya, Nandini Chauhan, Nupur Asher, Paridhi, Devrat, Ashay, Kishan Pratap, Ankit, Bhumika, Rajat, Govind and others all students from various law and other colleges of the country under the guidance of Prem Krishan Sharma, President PUCL, Rajasthan.*

*The tables were prepared by Vijay Goel, Guided by Dr Ashok Khandelwal and written by Kavita Srivastava.*

---

**76, Shanti Niketan Colony, Kisan Marg, Jaipur -302015**  
**Phone: 0141-2594131, 2206139, 9351562965, 09811529950 Fax: 0141-2710170**  
**E--mail: pucl.rajasthan@gmail.com**